Interpreting the I-Xe system in individual silicate grains from Toluca IAB

O. V. PRAVDIVTSEVA1*, A. P. MESHIK1, C. M. HOHENBERG1, and M. PETAEV2

1Washington University, Box 1105, One Brookings Drive, Saint Louis, Missouri 63117, USA
2Department of Earth and Planetary Sciences, Harvard University, 20 Oxford St., Hoffman 208 Cambridge, Massachusetts 02138, USA
*Corresponding author. E-mail: olga@physics.wustl.edu

(Received 24 March 2009; revision accepted 25 August 2009)

Abstract—Detailed isotopic and mineralogical studies of silicate inclusions separated from a troilite nodule of the Toluca IAB iron meteorite reveal the presence of radiogenic 129Xe in chlorapatite, plagioclase, perryite, and pyroxene grains. Subsequent I-Xe studies of 32 neutron-irradiated pyroxene grains indicate that high-Mg and low-Mg pyroxenes have distinctive I-Xe signatures. The I-Xe system in high-Mg pyroxenes closed at 4560.5 ± 2.4 Ma, probably reflecting exsolution of silicates from the melt, while the low-Mg pyroxenes closed at 4552.0 ± 3.7 Ma, 8.5 Ma later, providing a means for determining the cooling rate at the time of exsolution. If the host Toluca graphite-troilite-rich inclusion formed after the breakup and reassembly of the IAB parent body as has been suggested, the I-Xe ages of the high-Mg pyroxenes separated from this inclusions indicate that this catastrophic impact occurred not later than 4560.5 Ma, 6.7 Ma after formation of CAIs. The cooling rate at the time of silicates exsolution in Toluca is 14.5 ± 10.0 °C/Ma.

INTRODUCTION

IAB iron meteorites have complicated textures and chemical-mineralogical features that indicate a complex history for the IAB parent body. They commonly contain abundant silicate inclusions with chondritic mineralogy embedded in the metal phase. In an attempt to create the least complicated formation scenario, Benedix et al. (2000) explored a hypothesis in which the parent body began to differentiate, but the differentiation process was interrupted by a catastrophic impact with gravitational reassembly responsible for the mixing of different lithologies from different regions in the parent body. Although this hypothesis does not completely explain all properties of these rocks, it does explain the mixing of solid silicates with molten metal and slow (<700 °C/Ma) cooling rates for the buried, reassembled debris.

Wasson and Kallemeyn (2002) argued that abundance of fine (≤100 µm) silicates in low-Au irons points towards fast cooling, so the viscosity of the melt became large on a time scale short compared to the time necessary for silicate grains to separate from the melt. Fast cooling could be also responsible for the small sizes of the γ-iron crystals parental to the Widmanstätten pattern and for the limited thermal effects recorded in the silicates, including abundant primordial rare gases (Schultz and Franke 2000). Similar element-Au trends suggested for the different groups of IAB irons, and for related meteorites, could also be the results of similar processes instigated by independent impact events that occurred either at separate locations on the same asteroid or on separate but compositionally similar asteroids (Wasson and Kallemeyn 2002).

IABs cooling rates (~25–70 °C/Ma), obtained from the Widmanstätten structures in the metal phases and inferred for metal grains in chondritic inclusions, were consistent for the same meteorites (Herpfer et al. 1994), and correlated well with their Ni content. Based on these relatively slow cooling rates, the spread in apparent radiometric ages that is observed and the proposed complex formation scenarios (Benedix et al. 2000; Wasson and Kallemeyn 2002; Bogard et al. 2005) suggested that different chronometers might record different events in the history of the IAB parent body, and that the I-Xe system was not reset during metamorphism reflected in much younger Ar-Ar and Sm-Nd ages. In this work we present new I-Xe data for the Toluca IAB iron meteorite. Toluca is an optimum object for this study. It is not heavily shocked with the troilite nodules rarely showing any evidence for micro-melting (Buchwald 1975), and the presence of radiogenic noble gases indicates that the early records have been preserved in at least some phases (Bogard et al. 1968).

129I decays to radiogenic 129Xe (denoted 129*Xe), forming the basis for I-Xe dating (Hohenberg and Pravdivtseva 2008). The chronometric parameter here is the ratio of stable 127I to 129I at the time of Xe closure. A tracer for 127I is iodine-derived 128Xe (denoted 128*Xe), produced by neutron capture on 127I in a reactor, so the 129*Xe/128*Xe ratio, properly
monitored, provides the chronometry. Direct monitoring of the neutron capture probability is impractical for several reasons. A calibration procedure by means of a reference meteorite standard yields the highest precision of both relative (in our case to the irradiation standard Shallowater) and absolute closure times. In I-Xe dating Xe isotopes released in step-wise heating result in linear isochrons, mixtures of “trapped” Xe and unique values of 129*Xe/128*Xe, defining the values for the 129I/127I at closure (Hohenberg and Pravdivtseva 2008).

SAMPLE PREPARATION

Toluca fragment USNM 931, described in detail by Benedix et al. (2000), was obtained from the Smithsonian National History Museum. This fragment contained remnants of three troilite inclusions, one with abundant silicate grains of different morphology. From this troilite nodule we handpicked 23 grains which were placed on an SEM stub with carbon tape for SEM studies with energy-dispersive X-ray analyses on a JEOL-840A scanning electron microscope providing phase identification (Fig. 1) and quantification of phase purity. The grains were then removed from the SEM mount, washed in methanol and de-ionized water, and then desiccated overnight. Each grain was weighed twice using a Cahn C-31 microbalance with an additional 24 hours of drying between weighings to confirm dehydration by weight reproducibility. They were then loaded onto the target mount for laser extraction and subsequent xenon isotopic analysis. The target mount for laser extraction from the individual grains consists of a matrix of 1 mm holes (one grain per hole) in an Al laser stub. This stub fits inside of the laser extraction cell with a Pyrex view-port for laser entry and optical viewing. This cell is attached by flexible stainless steel tubing to the gas preparation system of an ion-counting noble gas mass spectrometer (Hohenberg 1980).

Typically, total degassing by complete melting (confirmed by spherical droplet formation) of an average-sized (~20 µg) grain takes about five seconds with a 100 W CW Nd:YAG laser (1.06 µm) focused on the grain. The actual laser power delivered to the grain (~25 W) is controlled by a pair of water-cooled Glan-Thompson air-spaced polarizers with continuously variable orientations and adjusted in real time for rapid melting. “Hot blanks”, typically ~2 × 10^{-15} cm^3 STP 132Xe, are measured at similar laser power levels directed into empty holes in the stub so any parasitic heating effects are replicated.

Trapped Xe refers to the component originally incorporated in the mineral, with an isotopic composition typically referred to as “planetary” Xe. We use OC Xe (Lavielle and Marti 1992) for the trapped composition, but for most I-Xe applications trapped Xe is sufficiently close to other prevalent Xe components, even atmospheric Xe, that this choice is not important. For typical I-Xe dating, trapped Xe is never a consideration since trapped Xe always forms one endpoint of the I-Xe isochron. However, for this study we want to determine the iodine carrier phase, so the 129Xe content of each grain was found by removing the trapped Xe component (Fig. 1). None of the troilite, kamacite, olivine or daubreelite grains contained detectable 129Xe. The single plagioclase grain contained a significant fraction of trapped Xe and thus a correspondingly larger uncertainty of the 129Xe content. Both chlorapatites, at least two pyroxenes, and one perryite grain were dominated by 129Xe. The apparent slight negative quantity of radiogenic 129Xe in one of the troilites is an artifact due to the large correction for trapped Xe. Three lawrencite grains, a terrestrial weathering product, separated from the same Toluca troilite nodule, were analyzed as a reference and contained no 129Xe.

Although at least three different silicates contained clear amounts of 129Xe, and were thus potentially suitable for the I-Xe studies, we focused on the pyroxene grains since they were generally larger in size and more abundant. Moreover, the clear correlation between the Mg/(Fe+Mg) ratios and the concentration of 129Xe that was observed in these unirradiated pyroxenes (Pravdivtseva et al. 1998) suggested that thermochronological studies of these silicates may be productive (McDougall and Harrison 1999).

We separated 63 pyroxene grains from the same troilite nodule of the Toluca fragment USNM 931. After the identification procedure described above, the concentrations of Fe, Mg, Si, and Al were determined from their X-ray
spectra, which also revealed the presence of Ni and Cr in some grains in smaller amounts (<1% atomic). Sulfur concentrations were measured to monitor possible troilite intergrowth (its corresponding Fe would corrupt the Mg/(Fe+Mg) trends). Although the high Mg/(Fe+Mg) pyroxene grains were the more abundant, we selected 32 grains of a more uniform range, exhibiting a continuous trend of Mg/(Fe+Mg) ratios so we could clearly delineate the correlation of this trend with their 129*Xe contents (Table 1).

The selected grains, along with Shallowater enstatite (reference standard), were weighed and sealed under vacuum in fused-quartz ampoules for neutron irradiation, receiving ≈2 × 10^19 n/cm^2 as part of the SLC-14 capsule at the University of Missouri Research Reactor (UMRR). To control the uniformity of neutron fluence the samples were placed in a fixed plane at the center of the vertical neutron profile in the pool of the reactor to minimize any vertical gradient, and the capsule was continuously rotated to eliminate any x-y gradient. To monitor any possible fluence variations, neutron doses were monitored by Co-doped Ni flux wires placed strategically around the periphery of the irradiation capsule interspersed with the sample vials. Subsequent counting of these flux wires confirmed neutron variations of <1% among the samples. After irradiation the grains were loaded into individual holes in target mount for laser extraction and mass spectrometry. The samples studied here were too small to allow conventional I-Xe step-wise extractions, so Xe was extracted individually from each grain by total melting, as described for the unirradiated grains, and the xenon isotopic compositions were measured by ion counting mass-spectrometry (Hohenberg 1980).

### RESULTS

Xenon isotopic compositions for individual Toluca pyroxene grains are shown in Table 2. 132Xe concentrations...
Table 2. Xenon isotopic compositions for individual Toluca pyroxene grains.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grain #</th>
<th>Weight, μg</th>
<th>132Xe × 10^{-10}</th>
<th>128Xe</th>
<th>129Xe</th>
<th>130Xe</th>
<th>131Xe</th>
<th>134Xe</th>
<th>136Xe</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>12.3</td>
<td>336.7</td>
<td>0.9781</td>
<td>0.7381</td>
<td>224.316</td>
<td>235.69</td>
<td>18.415</td>
<td>254.112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>23.1</td>
<td>63.3</td>
<td>0.7813</td>
<td>0.5745</td>
<td>20.202</td>
<td>16.25</td>
<td>2.738</td>
<td>21.508</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>46.0</td>
<td>230.2</td>
<td>2.9797</td>
<td>-0.4473</td>
<td>397.073</td>
<td>349.80</td>
<td>23.870</td>
<td>181.282</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>21.6</td>
<td>35.6</td>
<td>1.5035</td>
<td>1.400</td>
<td>19.480</td>
<td>20.13</td>
<td>3.893</td>
<td>11.514</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>23.6</td>
<td>341.2</td>
<td>0.8316</td>
<td>0.8522</td>
<td>133.565</td>
<td>338.87</td>
<td>16.010</td>
<td>104.561</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>28.8</td>
<td>204.6</td>
<td>0.6367</td>
<td>0.4688</td>
<td>8.700</td>
<td>16.72</td>
<td>1.923</td>
<td>8.543</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>73.2</td>
<td>0.7649</td>
<td>1.4451</td>
<td>218.427</td>
<td>223.30</td>
<td>14.473</td>
<td>195.014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>56.2</td>
<td>0.6487</td>
<td>0.8830</td>
<td>10.984</td>
<td>12.10</td>
<td>1.601</td>
<td>12.988</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>18.2</td>
<td>85.8</td>
<td>1.1773</td>
<td>1.0396</td>
<td>71.317</td>
<td>118.781</td>
<td>10.845</td>
<td>220.267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>12.3</td>
<td>162.0</td>
<td>0.1016</td>
<td>0.4125</td>
<td>148.960</td>
<td>194.10</td>
<td>12.856</td>
<td>126.895</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>237.4</td>
<td>1.2624</td>
<td>1.4037</td>
<td>21.727</td>
<td>38.903</td>
<td>2.923</td>
<td>18.903</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>18.2</td>
<td>154.3</td>
<td>2.1412</td>
<td>2.8550</td>
<td>212.121</td>
<td>229.43</td>
<td>20.984</td>
<td>168.695</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>12.1</td>
<td>152.0</td>
<td>2.3348</td>
<td>2.0022</td>
<td>13.905</td>
<td>23.973</td>
<td>4.860</td>
<td>17.312</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>345.5</td>
<td>1.7268</td>
<td>0.3660</td>
<td>225.746</td>
<td>209.64</td>
<td>14.187</td>
<td>311.729</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>19.4</td>
<td>87.9</td>
<td>0.8115</td>
<td>1.4733</td>
<td>294.563</td>
<td>270.91</td>
<td>15.983</td>
<td>248.049</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>12.4</td>
<td>137.5</td>
<td>1.6993</td>
<td>1.2197</td>
<td>21.695</td>
<td>23.29</td>
<td>2.896</td>
<td>25.404</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>12.3</td>
<td>148.7</td>
<td>1.3061</td>
<td>0.6455</td>
<td>171.796</td>
<td>177.82</td>
<td>19.132</td>
<td>180.334</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>357.8</td>
<td>1.1948</td>
<td>1.5702</td>
<td>27.196</td>
<td>23.96</td>
<td>2.179</td>
<td>22.280</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>13.7</td>
<td>118.0</td>
<td>0.3052</td>
<td>0.3437</td>
<td>171.528</td>
<td>178.25</td>
<td>11.358</td>
<td>249.692</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td>18.3</td>
<td>200.6</td>
<td>0.8984</td>
<td>0.7591</td>
<td>9.113</td>
<td>13.51</td>
<td>2.545</td>
<td>21.180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>19.9</td>
<td>93.1</td>
<td>0.8293</td>
<td>1.0441</td>
<td>6.155</td>
<td>8.13</td>
<td>2.649</td>
<td>11.422</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>12.6</td>
<td>76.5</td>
<td>5.2407</td>
<td>-3.8534</td>
<td>69.731</td>
<td>125.12</td>
<td>19.940</td>
<td>678.432</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48</td>
<td>13.7</td>
<td>118.0</td>
<td>2.0866</td>
<td>1.6905</td>
<td>7.052</td>
<td>13.97</td>
<td>5.246</td>
<td>83.612</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51</td>
<td>110.2</td>
<td>39.7</td>
<td>0.4538</td>
<td>0.5250</td>
<td>14.768</td>
<td>15.14</td>
<td>2.271</td>
<td>26.632</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55</td>
<td>45.0</td>
<td>345.8</td>
<td>0.3241</td>
<td>1.6079</td>
<td>276.010</td>
<td>271.25</td>
<td>23.821</td>
<td>381.574</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>56</td>
<td>9.2</td>
<td>276.8</td>
<td>0.2514</td>
<td>0.2054</td>
<td>4.436</td>
<td>4.62</td>
<td>1.216</td>
<td>9.901</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>61</td>
<td>19.8</td>
<td>200.0</td>
<td>1.5907</td>
<td>-0.0552</td>
<td>298.111</td>
<td>246.87</td>
<td>20.143</td>
<td>368.844</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>63</td>
<td>25.5</td>
<td>203.1</td>
<td>1.1475</td>
<td>0.8046</td>
<td>18.208</td>
<td>18.01</td>
<td>2.356</td>
<td>30.503</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

O. V. Pravdivtseva et al.
range from $35.6 \times 10^{-12}$ to $357.8 \times 10^{-12}$ ccSTP/g of $^{132}$Xe, with average value $184.5 \times 10^{-12}$ ccSTP/g, in agreement with the previously reported data for Mundrabilla (IAB) silicates and etched Pitts (IAB) silicates (Niemeyer 1979a). $^{129}$Xe was variable (loosely correlated with the Mg/(Fe+Mg) ratio with the amounts consistent with those observed by Niemeyer [1979a]).

In I-Xe studies using step-wise heating, the data are typically presented in three-isotope correlation plots where the $^{129}$Xe/$^{132}$Xe ratios released in the incremental fractions are plotted versus the $^{128}$Xe/$^{132}$Xe ratios. The choice of normalization isotope ($^{132}$Xe or $^{130}$Xe) depends upon the precision of these ratios, as corrected for (usually small) fission or spallation contributions. The low-temperature extractions (from the less retentive sites) usually contain uncorrelated xenon due to the partial loss of the radiogenic $^{129}$Xe or superficial iodine contamination. These low temperature points in step-wise extraction are not included in the isochron, the slope of which provides the I-Xe age normalized by the Shallowater reference standard.

For these Toluca pyroxene grains the Xe is released with laser volatilization in one step and thus it contains both correlated and uncorrelated iodine-derived Xe. The extraction cell was heated to 220 °C prior to the analysis to remove superficial atmospheric contributions. But since pyroxene usually yields a linear isochron in the temperature range of 1200 to 1800 °C, the pre-heating temperature is insufficient for completely separating uncorrelated and correlated iodine-derived Xe. Each experimental point on three isotope plot (Fig. 2a) therefore represents all of the xenon released from each of the Toluca grains, not just the correlated portion. However, as will be discussed later, this is a small effect and does not affect the results.

Small corrections were made for the minor amounts of $^{132}$Xe produced by neutron fission of $^{235}$U in the reactor. The maximum fission contribution (grain #29) was 27%, while for all other samples it was much less, varying from 0.2% to 10%. Fission corrections were made by partitioning the measured $^{134}$Xe/$^{132}$Xe ratios between that of $^{235}$U fission and that in nominal trapped Xe. Although both $^{130}$Xe and $^{132}$Xe normalizations give the same ages, normalization to (fission-corrected) $^{132}$Xe is usually preferred because of the smaller uncertainties it yields.

The experimental data from all irradiated Toluca grains are shown on Fig. 2a. If the iodine-xenon systems in a range of grains closed at the same time, and there were no uncorrelated Xe, the xenon released from these grains would form an isochron on the three isotope plot, a mixing line between trapped Xe and iodine-derived Xe. Any uncorrelated xenon, with its excess $^{138}$Xe, would move the experimental points to the right in the figure. However, in previous studies of samples whose radiogenic fractions are as large as these, the I-Xe record is usually preserved and most of the iodine-derived Xe is correlated with an average of about 80% forming the isochron (Hohenberg et al. 2004). Although small contributions from uncorrelated iodine can vary from grain-to-grain, the resulting points will scatter somewhat, but after eliminating obvious outliers, the slope of the isochron will not be affected very much and provide a reliable I-Xe age, although with somewhat less precision. That these groups of grains form fairly good isochrons (linear arrays in Figs. 2b, and 2e) argues to this point.

To investigate the correlation between closure times of the I-Xe system in the pyroxene grains with varying Mg, suggested by the observations of unirradiated pyroxenes (Pravdivtseva et al. 1998), we sorted the grains according to their Mg/(Mg+Fe) ratios (Table 1). Since the unirradiated troilite grains in our preliminary study demonstrated presence of variable amounts of $^{129}$Xe in troilite, we excluded 9 grains with troilite contents higher than 10% (shown in italics) from the calculations of the apparent isochron slopes. Slopes of the isochrons for the high-Mg grains (column 12, Table 1) were calculated as follows: The first number in column 10 is the slope of the line formed by the first six grains with the highest Mg-number (#20, #36, #63, #28, #46 and #17). Then we add more data, grain-by-grain, so the next slope (the next number in column 10) is calculated for the line formed by the first 7 grains and so on, down to grain #29, the 10th grain. At this point the uncertainty of the slope reaches its minimum. We thus consider here the 10 grains with the highest Mg/(Mg+Fe) ratios to be Mg-rich. Among this group of pyroxenes the Mg/(Mg+Fe) ratio varies by about 8%. Grain #27 has the lowest Mg-number of 0.6994 and that is about 10% lower than that of the next lowest grain, #56. Because of that difference, we adopted an 8% range for the increase in Mg/(Mg+Fe) ratios starting with grain #56. This gives us 6 grains (including grain #27) for the apparent low-Mg isochron. The smaller number of grains for the low-Mg pyroxenes isochron reflects the low abundance of these grains in this Toluca nodule. The grains with higher Fe content were generally smaller, more brittle and thus more difficult to separate.

All of the values in column 10 are calculated for the correlation lines forced through the OC point, thus reducing false trends due to a few outliers. As we mentioned, the presence of uncorrelated Xe would move the experimental points to the right, away from the isochron in Fig. 2. To investigate this effect we also calculated slopes for free-fit correlation lines (not forced through OC), displayed in Fig. 2 and in column 10 (Table 1).

Slope values change gradually when increasing numbers of grains are used to define the correlation line. For the high-Mg pyroxenes when 6 grains define the line, the maximum spread of $^{129}$Xe/$^{132}$Xe and $^{128}$Xe/$^{132}$Xe ratios is achieved. The addition of 4 more points, improves the uncertainty of the apparent isochron slope, giving us $0.705 \pm 0.034$, but does not significantly affect the slope value itself. Similar behavior can be observed when the correlation lines are not forced through OC, resulting in a slope of $0.767 \pm 0.059$. We then calculated...
Fig. 2. Three isotope plots for individual pyroxene grains, separated from a Toluca IAB graphite-rich troilite nodule. Because of the presence of fission-produced Xe, the best isotope of normalization would have been $^{130}$Xe. However, since these were small grains, the lower abundance of $^{130}$Xe compromises the precision, so we normalize to $^{132}$Xe after correction for fission contributions, based upon the observed $^{134}$Xe/$^{132}$Xe ratios. This introduces correlated errors which show up here as oblique 1σ error bars. a) Data points for all of the analyzed grains shown. Numbered grains have troilite content higher than 10% and were excluded from isochron slope determinations. Different I-Xe ages are indicated for these grains depending upon their Mg/(Mg + Fe) ratios. b) These apparent isochrons show the smallest possible age difference between the two groups of Toluca grains (see text): with higher (solid circles) and with lower (open circles) Mg/(Mg+Fe) ratios. c) The isochrons shown here are derived from the “best fit” lines of these two groups of Toluca grains: with higher (solid circles) and lower (open circles) Mg/(Mg+Fe) numbers.
the free fit and the fit forced through OC for the 5 “best fit”
grains from the high-Mg group, resulting in slopes of 0.75 ±
0.11 and 0.837 ± 0.055, respectively (Fig. 2c), which
excluded some grains anomalously to the right of the
isochron, suggesting the presence of significant uncorrelated
Xe. Among these were grains #36, #15 and #46. Grains #36
and #15 had compositions close to trapped, thus very low in
$^{129}$Xe, and grain #46 had ~8% plagioclase.

We now have 4 values for the slopes of I-Xe correlation
lines for the high-Mg pyroxenes. Those forced through OC
component point yielded the highest values, with “best fit”
points providing steepest apparent isochron (slope 0.837 ±
0.055) and the value based on all 10 grains being the lowest
0.705 ± 0.034. Slopes of the free fit correlation lines vary less,
from 0.75 ± 0.11 for “best fit” 5 points slope and 0.767 ±
0.059 for 10 points. This suggests that the free fit may best
represent that I-Xe age since the small addition of
uncorrelated Xe is averaged out (the line moves collectively
to the right, rather than being forced to pivot about OC, thus
increasing its slope).

Values for the slopes of the correlation lines formed by
the low-Mg pyroxenes were obtained in a straight-forward
manner. Since grain #35 demonstrated extremely low $^{129}$Xe
content, comparable with planetary xenon, we did not use this
grain in the calculations. It left us with only 5 grains in this set
of samples. As with the high-Mg grains, we calculated the
slopes for two apparent isochrons, forced through OC
component point and free fit lines. These provided more
consistent I-Xe ages, with slopes that differ by only 1%
(Table 1).

Relative Ages of Mineral Groups and Absolute I-Xe Ages
of Toluca Silicates

The free fit correlation line using “best fit” grains
probably provides the most accurate value for the slope of the
high-Mg pyroxenes isochron, and hence the closure time of
the I-Xe system in high-Mg pyroxenes. Using different fits,
and different grain selections among the group, a range of
closure times 0.3–4.2 Ma after Shallowater were found (the
extreme values here were correlation lines forced through the
OC composition), but the most probable was the free-fit
isochron yielding closure 2.8 ± 2.4 Ma after Shallowater. For
the low-Mg group, the I-Xe closure time is well-determined at
11.3 ± 3.7 Ma after Shallowater. The closure time difference
between the high- and low-Mg groups is then set at 8.5 ±
4.4 Ma (using free fit correlation lines).

With absolute age of Shallowater enstatite determined to
be 4563.3 ± 0.4 Ma (Gilmour et al. 2004, 2006), this
sets closure of the I-Xe system in high-Mg pyroxenes at
4560.5 ± 2.4 Ma, and the low-Mg pyroxenes at 4552.0 ±
3.7, well within the previously reported range of I-Xe ages
for IAB iron meteorites (Niemeyer 1979a; Bogard et al.
2005).

Interpretation

The IAB iron meteorites are famous for their puzzling
combination of metal matrix and often abundant silicate-
bearing inclusions. A number of hypotheses have been
postulated for the formation of the IAB iron meteorites.
According to the latest scenario by Benedix et al. (2000), IAB
iron and winonaites meteorites were part of the same
chondritic parent body, one that was heated by a non-
collisional heat source leading to partial melting and
incomplete differentiation. A subsequent catastrophic impact
caused fragmentation and then reassembly of the partially
melted parent body, resulting in extensive mixing of solid
silicates, molten metal, and sulfides. If such impacts were
common events in the early solar system (Scott 2004), IAB
meteorites could possibly experience more than one impact
event. This makes comparisons of the chronological data
from different meteorites quite difficult, and even more
difficult comparison of ages provided by different
chronometers for samples from different IAB meteorites.

Ar-Ar ages of 10 IAB meteorites, 2 winonaites and K-Ar
ages of Toluca and Four Corners range from 4.32 to 4.55 Ga
(Podosek 1970; Niemeyer 1979a, 1979b; Benedix et al. 1998;
Takeda et al. 2000; Bogard et al. 1968, 2005). In all IAB
meteorites studied so far, I-Xe ages are generally older, from
4.5579 ± 0.0001 to 4.5762 ± 0.0024 Ga (Podosek 1970;
Niemeyer 1979a; Bogard et al. 2005). The I-Xe ages reported
by Niemeyer (1979a) are among the oldest, seeming to
predate the Pb-Pb ages of CAIs by about 7 Ma (Chen et al.
1981; Göpel et al. 1991; Amelin et al. 2002). It has been
established that proper irradiation monitors are essential in I-
Xe dating (Hohenberg et al. 2000; Pravdivtseva et al. 2003;
Hohenberg and Pravdivtseva 2008). Niemeyer (1979a)
analyzed three independent flux monitors: KI salt, and two
meteorites St. Séverin and Bjurböle. Both St. Séverin and
Bjurböle yielded disturbed correlation lines, and three
aliquots of KI gave “badly discrepant results” (Niemeyer
1979a). Moreover, it was shown later that St. Séverin has two
distinct lithologies with I-Xe age difference of 6.8 Ma
(Hohenberg et al. 1981). Pure iodine compounds are not
appropriate as I-Xe monitors, as discussed by Hohenberg and
Pravdivtseva (2008), since the sharp resonances in the
neutron capture cross sections of $^{127}$I lead to self-shielding.
This uncertainty in the absolute age, caused by the
deficiencies of the monitors, could be responsible for the old
ages reported by Niemeyer (1979a). Even without this set of
seven ages, the remaining five I-Xe absolute ages are
consistently older than corresponding Ar-Ar ages.

Bogard et al. (2005) suggested two possible explanations
for this age discrepancy in IABs and winonaites: That the I-
Xe system in IAB meteorites was not reset during early parent
body breakup and reassembly, or that there is a bias in the
decay parameters for $^{40}$K, with the renormalized Ar-Ar ages
for most meteorites about 30 Ma older (Renne 2000; Trieloff
et al. 2003). While a revised decay constant can address an age bias between I-Xe and Ar-Ar, it cannot address the observed age spread. When the revised 40K decay constant (Mundil et al. 2006) is applied in recent work by Vogel and Renne (2008), the resulting Ar-Ar ages of silicates from the IAB irons Caddo County, Campo del Cielo, Landes and Ocotillo are closer to that of I-Xe in some cases, they still demonstrate a wide range of absolute ages from 4562 ± 20 Ma (Caddo County) to 4362 ± 40 Ma (Campo del Cielo). These ages did not correlate with grain sizes or “quality” grades of the plagioclase separates studied. It led the authors to the conclusion that IAB silicate Ar-Ar ages should depend much more on the pre- and post-impact cooling rates and on burial depth than on the time of the actual impact. However, the more retentive I-Xe ages, which tend to cluster at ~4560 Ma for these objects, could more closely reflect the closure time after catastrophic impact and reassembly of the IAB parent body.

Toluca Cooling Rate

I-Xe ages from this work provide different closure times for the high and low-Mg pyroxenes in Toluca. Although the isochrons in these grains are based on all released Xe (correlated and uncorrelated), the effect of uncorrelated Xe has been evaluated and minimized. Even with the uncertainty of uncorrelated Xe, the age differences derived for these two groups of Toluca pyroxenes are clearly defined. This age difference and the mineralogical properties of these two grain types form the basis for determination of the cooling rate.

Although the actual closure temperatures for Xe in high- and low-Mg pyroxenes are not known with certainty, it is the difference in closure temperatures that provides the cooling rate. For a zeroth order estimate of cooling rate, the differences in melting temperatures of these two minerals might be used. The melting temperature for enstatite, MgSiO$_3$, is 1557 °C (Lodders and Fegley 1998). Crystallization of protoenstatite from a melt was observed at 1564 ± 2 °C, with the subsequent transformation of this unquenchable phase into clinoenstatite after rapid cooling (Nikitin 1948). Crystallization temperatures for low-Mg pyroxenes could be deduced from the parameters of the controlled-gas quench furnace synthesis of Ca-Mg-Fe pyroxenes (Turnock et al. 1973). It was observed that pyroxenes with Mg number less than 0.50 will melt if synthesized at 1200 °C (atmospheric pressure), standard heating temperature for the synthesis of pyroxenes with higher Mg numbers. Thus all low-Mg synthesis experiments were conducted at 1150 °C to avoid melting.

The relationship between the crystallization temperature and the Mg and Fe concentrations in the enstatite-ferrosilite solid solution series is difficult to establish and the linear approximation used here is for the 1.0–0.5 Mg number range, not for the whole enstatite-ferrosilite solid solution series. Using the crystallization temperatures for known components (Lodders and Fegley 1998; Turnock et al. 1973), a linear relationship $\text{Temperature} = 728 \times (\text{Mg-number}) + 836$ can be established for intermediate compositions with Mg-numbers in the 1.00–0.50 range. The temperatures provided by this relationship are 1345 to 1441 °C for low-Mg pyroxenes and 1486 to 1545 °C for high-Mg pyroxenes. Using the two group averages, 1393 ± 48 °C and 1516 ± 29 °C, respectively, the difference in closure temperature is 123 ± 56 °C. With the 123 ± 56 °C temperature interval and the corresponding 8.5 ± 4.4 Ma age difference, the cooling rate at the time of silicate exsolution in Toluca (presumably after breakup and reassembly of parent body) is found to be 14.5 ± 10.0 °C/Ma. Although the linear approximation may allow us to estimate the difference in closure temperature for the I-Xe system in high- and low-Mg silicates with better precision, it is still the major contributor to the cooling rate uncertainty.

It was first shown by Tammann (1926) that the diffusion properties of iron oxides and silicates change in a narrow range of temperatures, a factor of 0.5–0.52 below their melting temperatures. This, the so-called Tammann temperature, represents the commencement of significant self-diffusion. In this case the Tammann temperature corresponds to 724 ± 17 °C and 788 ± 48 °C for the low- and high-Mg pyroxenes, respectively, leading to an apparent cooling rate of about 7.5 °C/Ma. While such solid-state mobility may be the operative mechanism for the onset of diffusion of small chemically-active atoms, it may not accurately reflect the initiation of diffusion for the large inert Xe atoms within a crystal lattice. In fact, it has been independently shown that the I-Xe chronometer is less susceptible to resetting by thermal events than chronometers based upon chemically active species, such as Pb-Pb (Pravdivtseva et al. 2004) so the Tammann temperature may not be as applicable as the crystallization temperature for Xe closure in these minerals. The uncertainty of cooling rate derived from the difference in crystallization temperatures (14.5 ± 10.0 °C/Ma) overlaps the cooling rate derived from the difference in Tammann temperatures.

A metallographic cooling rate for Toluca was first estimated by Wood (1964) and later determined to be 25 ± 15 °C/Ma (Saikumar and Goldstein 1988). In the Saikumar and Goldstein model, the interface between the kamacite and taenite was only allowed to move in one direction, to deplete the taenite phase, and diffusion in the kamacite phase was assumed to be infinitely fast at temperatures above ~450 °C. In a later model by Hopfe and Goldstein (2001), the movement of the kamacite/taenite interface was allowed in either direction, and kamacite growth in the temperature interval 700–200 °C for Toluca was simulated for several linear cooling rates and number of impingement lengths to develop appropriate curves using the Wood method. Although the Wood curves from the Hopfe and Goldstein model seem to provide a better fit to the experimental data,
that model still yields the same cooling rate for Toluca, 25 °C/ Ma, as reported earlier (Saikumar and Goldstein 1998), but now with a more realistic feel for the uncertainty, now listed as a factor of 2 (Hopfe and Goldstein 2001).

CONCLUSION

According to the $^{207}$Pb-$^{206}$Pb data, calcium-aluminum inclusions from Efremovka (CV3) and Allende (CV3) are the oldest of solar system solids, formed at 4567.2 ± 0.6 Ma (Chen et al. 1981; Göpel et al. 1991; Amelin et al. 2002). The $^{207}$Pb-$^{206}$Pb ages of chondrules range from 4566.7 ± 1.0 Ma for Allende (CV3) to 4564.7 ± 0.7 Ma for Acfer 059 (CR2), 4562.7 ± 1.7 Ma for Richardton (H5) and 4562.7 ± 0.5 Ma for Gujba (CBA) (Amelin et al. 2004; Amelin et al. 2005). Although the I-Xe ages for chondrules from different types of ordinary chondrites have a real spread, reflecting their complicated metamorphic histories, the oldest chondrules from the most primitive of these, Bjurböle, Richardton and Semarkona, cluster tightly at about 1.8 ± 1.8 Ma after formation of CAIs (Hohenberg and Pravdivtseva 2008). These observations suggest that if indeed the Pb-Pb age of the Gujba chondrule reflects its formation time, as was argued by Amelin et al. (2004), the protoplanetary nebula still existed 4.5 Ma after formation of the oldest known solids. Based on the constraints available from long- and short-lived chronometers, Wadhwa et al. (2006) concluded that differentiation of planetesimals in the early history of the solar system occurred quite rapidly. Melting on some planetesimals was initiated as early as ~3–5 Ma after formation of the first solids and extended to more than ~10 Ma on others. According to the model proposed by Benedix et al. (2000), partial melting and metamorphism are crucial for the formation of IAB meteorites and appears to have produced five different lithologies. In that model, after breakup the reassembly resulted in a range of compositions forming the complex set of IAB meteorites. Benedix et al. (2000) suggested that some metallic melt bodies either remained intact or were not thoroughly mixed with silicate material during parent-body breakup and reassembly. This suggestion is supported by the occurrence of rounded, graphite-troilite-rich, silicate-poor inclusions found in Toluca, that almost certainly formed by exsolution from the still molten metal (Buchwald 1975). Silicates studied in this work were separated from one of such inclusion. If indeed this Toluca graphite-troilite-rich inclusion formed after the breakup and reassembly of the IAB parent body, the I-Xe age of the high-Mg pyroxenes separated from this inclusions indicate that this catastrophic impact occurred not later than 4560.5 ± 2.4 Ma, 6.7 Ma after formation of CAIs, in good agreement with time-scale estimates of planetesimals formation and differentiation (Wadhwa et al. 2006).

The cooling rate at the time of silicate exsolution in Toluca after breakup and reassembly of the IAB parent body is measured here to be 14.5 ± 10.0 °C/Ma, in agreement with the metallographic cooling rates found by Herpfer et al. (1994) and Hopfe and Goldstein (2001). More precise results can be expected when the mineral compositions and thus crystallization temperatures are more rigidly constrained but even these results provide further reassurance that closure temperature differences can be accurately estimated even if the actual closure temperatures are more elusive.

Acknowledgments—The authors thank Dr. Katharina Lodders for helpful suggestions, Prof. Joseph I. Goldstein for encouragement, productive discussion and comments during preparation of this manuscript; and Dr. Tim Swindle, Dr. Gretchen Benedix, and Dr. Alexis Busfield for providing helpful reviews. This work supported, in part, by NASA grant #NNG06GE84G.

Editorial Handling—Dr. Timothy Swindle

REFERENCES


